UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	
IN RE SEPTEMBER 11 LITIGATION	:
MARY BAVIS	:
Plaintiff,	:
-against-	:
UNITED AIRLINES, INC., et al.	:
Defendants.	:

ALVIN K. HELLERSTEIN, U.S.D.J.:

$\ \ $	USDC SDNY
11	DOCUMENT
	ELECTRANGCALLY FILED
	DOC #.
	DATE FILED: 3/2/10
įL	

ORDER DENYING MOTION FOR DAMAGES-ONLY TRIAL

21 MC 101 (AKH) 02 Civ. 7154 (AKH)

Defendants move for an order directing a damages-only trial. Plaintiff opposes the motion. The motion is denied.

I have reviewed each side's submissions. I ordered damages-only trials at an earlier time when, after an initial spate of settlements, many cases remained and values were uncertain. At that time, there were many impediments to discovery, chiefly stemming from issues of national security and the difficulties in obtaining clearance from the United States Transportation Security Agency of relevant discovery documents. There were difficulties as well in scheduling and taking of depositions. It was not clear that discovery could be completed in any reasonable period of time. In order to bypass these difficulties, I persuaded the parties that a few selected cases could be advanced for discovery and trial of issues relating to damages, and that the values reflected in such partial jury verdicts could be useful in assisting settlements.

Thus, six cases were selected for damages-only discovery and trials. See Order dated July 2, 2007, 21 MC 97, Doc. No. 1114; In re September 11 Litigation, 21 MC 97 (AKH), 2007 WL 1965559 (S.D.N.Y. July 5, 2007). The stratagem proved to be useful, and all but three of the remaining 41 cases settled.

At this point, a damages-only trial would not be helpful. The values of earlier settlements have erased the uncertainties regarding damages. Discovery has been completed, or is close to being completed. As plaintiff's submission represents, the parties have taken approximately 150 depositions, and the Transportation Security Agency, as of October 2009, processed approximately 450,000 pages of documents. The parties are just about ready for trial.

The court is now concerned with fixing trial schedules for cases in both the "100" and "101" master calendars, selecting representative cases to be tried, and effectuating various efficiencies. The parties in a number of cases have expressed interest in discussions of settlements, and the court should be attentive to those interests as well. At this point, conducting a damages-only trial for Bavis would be a diversion, rather than a useful stratagem.

In addition, it will not be easy to delineate what should be tried and what should be left open. Plaintiff will wish to present facts which they claim are relevant to damages, and which defendants will oppose as relevant mainly to liability. It will not be easy to delineate what might be advisory, and what, conclusive. The differences will intrude on time that could be better spent on more constructive issues.

Accordingly, defendants' motion is denied. The Clerk shall mark the motion (Doc. # 1005) as terminated.

SO ORDERED.

Dated:

United States District Judge